

Location 2 Holmdale Gardens London NW4 2LX

Reference: 22/6017/HSE Received: 19th December 2022
Accepted: 19th December 2022

Ward: Hendon Expiry: 13th February 2023

Case Officer: Lizzy Ruta

Applicant: Mrs Sharon Schurder

Proposal: Roof extension involving rear dormer, 5no front facing rooflights.
Alterations to fenestration

OFFICER'S RECOMMENDATION

Refuse

AND the Committee grants delegated authority to the Service Director – Planning and Building Control to make any minor alterations, additions or deletions to the recommended conditions/obligations or reasons for refusal as set out in this report and addendum provided this authority shall be exercised after consultation with the Chair (or in their absence the Vice-Chair) of the Committee (who may request that such alterations, additions or deletions be first approved by the Committee)

- 1 The proposed dormer roof extension, by reason of its width, scale, bulk and design, would fail to appear as a subordinate, proportionate or sympathetic addition, to the detriment of the character and appearance of the host property and the surrounding area. contrary to Policy D3 of the London Plan (2021), Policies CS1 and CS5 of the LB Barnet: Local Plan (Core Strategy) DPD (2012), Policy DM01 of the LB Barnet: Local Plan (Development Management Policies) DPD (2012), and the Residential Design Guidance SPD (2016).

Informative(s):

- 1 In accordance with paragraphs 38-57 of the NPPF, the Council takes a positive and proactive approach to development proposals, focused on solutions. To assist applicants in submitting development proposals, the Local Planning Authority (LPA) has produced planning policies and written guidance to guide applicants when submitting applications. These are all available on the Council's website. A pre-application advice service is also offered.

The applicant did not seek to engage with the LPA prior to the submission of this application through the established formal pre-application advice service. In accordance with paragraph 189 of the NPPF, the applicant is encouraged to utilise this service prior to the submission of any future formal planning applications, in order to engage pro-actively with the LPA to discuss possible solutions to the reasons for refusal.

2 The plans accompanying this application are:

EX-E001 - Existing Front & Rear Elevations
EX-E002 - Existing Side Elevations
EX-P001 - Existing Ground Floor
EX-P002 - Existing First Floor
EX-P004 - Existing Roof Plan
EX-S001 - Existing Section AA & BB
EX-3D - Existing 3D
PR-E001 - Proposed Front & Rear Elevations
PR-E002 - Proposed Side Elevations
PR-P001 - Proposed Ground Floor
PR-P002 - Proposed First Floor
PR-P003 - Proposed Loft Plan
PR-P004 - Proposed Roof Plan
PR-S001 - Proposed Section AA & BB
PR-3D - Proposed 3D
PR-3E - Proposed Volume

OFFICER'S ASSESSMENT

1. Site Description

The application site contains a semi-detached single family dwellinghouse situated at 2 Holmdale Gardens, London, NW4 2LX, in the ward of Hendon.

The site is not within a conservation area (designated as Article 2(3) land in The Town and Country Planning (General Permitted Development) (England) Order 2015 as amended) and is not within an area covered by an Article 4 direction. Furthermore, there are no conditions attached to the site which remove permitted development rights. There are no TPO's on site or nearby.

The surrounding area is predominantly residential, comprising mainly dwellinghouses and blocks of flats.

2. Relevant Site History

Reference: 22/4303/HSE

Address: 2 Holmdale Gardens, London, NW4 2LX

Decision: Approved subject to conditions

Decision Date: 27 October 2022

Description: Single storey side extension. Roof extension involving rear dormer, 5no front facing rooflights. Alterations to fenestration

Reference: 22/4304/192

Address: 2 Holmdale Gardens, London, NW4 2LX

Decision: Lawful

Decision Date: 19 September 2022

Description: Roof extension involving rear dormer and 2no front facing rooflights

3. Proposal

This application seeks planning permission for a roof extension involving rear dormer, 5no front facing rooflights. Alterations to fenestration.

This application seeks to extend the dormer as approved within application ref. 22/4303/HSE - which previously measured 3.67m in width, 2.81m in depth, 2.60m in height, and 13.4m³ in volume.

The revised dormer would be consistent in depth and height, and would measure 8.27m in width.

4. Public Consultation

Consultation letters were sent to 9 neighbouring properties.
No responses have been received.

5. Planning Considerations

5.1 Policy Context

National Planning Policy Framework and National Planning Practice Guidance

The determination of planning applications is made mindful of Central Government advice and the Local Plan for the area. It is recognised that Local Planning Authorities must determine applications in accordance with the statutory Development Plan, unless material considerations indicate otherwise, and that the planning system does not exist to protect the private interests of one person against another.

The National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) was amended in 2021. This is a key part of the Governments reforms to make the planning system less complex and more accessible, and to promote sustainable growth.

The NPPF states that 'good design is a key aspect of sustainable development, is indivisible from good planning, and should contribute positively to making places better for people'. The NPPF retains a presumption in favour of sustainable development. This applies unless any adverse impacts of a development would 'significantly and demonstrably' outweigh the benefits.

The Mayor's London Plan 2021

The London Development Plan is the overall strategic plan for London, and it sets out a fully integrated economic, environmental, transport and social framework for the development of the capital. It forms part of the development plan for Greater London and is recognised in the NPPF as part of the development plan.

The London Plan provides a unified framework for strategies that are designed to ensure that all Londoners benefit from sustainable improvements to their quality of life.

Barnet's Local Plan (2012)

Barnet's Local Plan is made up of a suite of documents including the Core Strategy and Development Management Policies Development Plan Documents. Both were adopted in September 2012.

- Relevant Core Strategy Policies: CS NPPF, CS1, CS5.
- Relevant Development Management Policies: DM01, DM02.

The Council's approach to extensions as set out in Policy DM01 is to minimise their impact on the local environment and to ensure that occupiers of new developments as well as neighbouring occupiers enjoy a high standard of amenity. Policy DM01 states that all development should represent high quality design and should be designed to allow for adequate daylight, sunlight, privacy and outlook for adjoining occupiers. Policy DM02 states that where appropriate, development will be expected to demonstrate compliance to minimum amenity standards and make a positive contribution to the Borough. The development standards set out in Policy DM02 are regarded as key for Barnet to deliver the highest standards of urban design.

Barnet's Local Plan (Reg 22) 2021

Barnet's Draft Local Plan on 26th November 2021 was submitted to the Planning Inspectorate for independent examination which will be carried out on behalf of the Secretary of State for the Department of Levelling Up, Housing and Communities. This is in accordance with Regulation 22 of the Town and Country Planning (Local Planning) (England) Regulations 2021 (as amended).

The Regulation 22 Local Plan sets out the Council's draft planning policy framework together with draft development proposals for 65 sites. The Local Plan 2012 remains the statutory development plan for Barnet until such stage as the replacement plan is adopted and as such applications should continue to be determined in accordance with the 2012 Local Plan, while noting that account needs to be taken of the policies and site proposals in the draft Local Plan and the stage that it has reached.

Supplementary Planning Documents

Residential Design Guidance SPD (2016)

- Sets out information for applicants to help them design developments which would receive favourable consideration by the Local Planning Authority. The SPD states that large areas of Barnet are characterised by relatively low density suburban housing with an attractive mixture of terrace, semi-detached and detached houses. The Council is committed to protecting, and where possible enhancing the character of the borough's residential areas and retaining an attractive street scene.

- States developments should normally be consistent in regard to the form, scale and architectural style of the original building which can be achieved through respecting the proportions of the existing house and using an appropriate roof form.

- In respect of amenity it states that developments should not be overbearing or unduly obtrusive and care should be taken to ensure that they do not result in harmful loss of outlook, appear overbearing, or cause an increased sense of enclosure to adjoining properties. They should not reduce light to neighbouring windows to habitable rooms or cause significant overshadowing, and should not look out of place, overbearing or intrusive when viewed from surrounding areas.

Sustainable Design and Construction SPD (adopted 2016)

- Provides detailed guidance that supplements policies in the adopted Local Plan and sets out how sustainable development will be delivered in Barnet.

5.2 Main issues for consideration

The main issues for consideration in this case are:

- Whether harm would be caused to the character and appearance of the existing building, the street scene and the wider locality;
- Whether harm would be caused to the living conditions of neighbouring residents.

5.3 Assessment of proposals

Impact of the proposal on the character and appearance of the building, the street scene and the wider area

Any scheme for the site will need to respect the character and appearance of the local area, relate appropriately to the site's context and comply with development plan policies in these respects. This will include suitably addressing the requirements of development plan policies such as DM01, CS05 (both of the Barnet Local Plan) and D3 (of the London Plan).

The Residential Design Guidance 2016 stipulates that dormer extensions should be subordinate additions to the roof slope and should not occupy more than half the width or half the depth of the roof slope. The dormer would measure 8.27m in width, spanning almost the entire width of the existing roof width. At this scaling, the development is not considered to be appropriately subordinate to the main dwellinghouse. The proposed dormer therefore fails to meet the requirements of the Residential Design Guidance.

It is noted that a dormer of similar scale was originally proposed in application ref. 22/4303/HSE. Officers sought amendments to reduce the dormer in width to reduce the visual bulk of the extension so as to not be a disproportionate addition to the property and the proposal could not otherwise be realised in exercise of permitted development rights. This application, following amendment agreements, was approved subject to conditions in 2022. It is considered that neither the site nor the surrounding area conditions have sufficiently changed to justify a larger width dormer that was originally proposed.

A review of aerial imagery indicates that rear dormer extensions are evident elsewhere amongst dwellinghouses along Holmdale Gardens and in the surrounding area. Despite there being a number of dormers in the area of similar or even larger scale, there is not a consistent scale or roof pattern to which the proposed would positively contribute and in general these unsympathetic and overly dominant roof extensions have been achieved only in exercise of permitted development rights.

The hip to gable extension was also previously approved under 22/4303/HSE. Nevertheless, when considered in conjunction with the proposed dormer extension, it is considered to have an overbearing cumulative impact on the existing dwellinghouse.

The council therefore maintains its decision that the proposed roof extension would be a disproportionate addition to the property to the detriment of the character of the dwellinghouse and fails to comply with the Residential Design Guidance.

Impact of the proposal on the amenities of neighbours

It is important that any scheme addresses the relevant development plan policies (for example policy DM01 of the Barnet Local Plan policy D6 of the London Plan) in respect of the protection of the amenities of neighbouring occupiers. This will include taking a full account of all neighbouring sites.

This proposal is not found to have an unduly harmful impact in terms of residential amenity. The rear dormer would have no harmful impact on the neighbour's outlook, natural light, or privacy relative to the approved scheme. The property is set a sufficient distance from any property to the rear to ensure that there would be no direct overlooking to windows. In addition, the proposed rooflights to the front roof slope would not detrimentally impact any neighbouring amenity. As such, the proposal does not negatively impact on the rights of the neighbouring residents.

5.4 Response to Public Consultation

N/A

6. Equality and Diversity Issues

The proposal does not conflict with either Barnet Council's Equalities Policy or the commitments set in the Equality Scheme and supports the Council in meeting its statutory equality responsibilities.

7. Conclusion

Having taken all material considerations into account, it is considered that the proposed development would have an unacceptable impact on the character and appearance of the application site and surrounding area. This application is therefore recommended for REFUSAL.

